# KIRKPATRICK'S TRAINING EVALUATION MODEL IN ASSOCIATES WITH THE EFFECTIVENESS OF SKIM LATIHAN 1 MALAYSIA (SL1M)

Zarina Mohd Zain [1],
[1] *Faculty of Administrative Science & Policy Studies,*
*UiTM Seremban, N. Sembilan*

Nor Suhaiza Md. Khalid [2]
[2] *Faculty of Administrative Science & Policy Studies,*
*UiTM Seremban, N. Sembilan*

Suzei Mat Nurudin [3]
[3]*Faculty of Administrative Science & Policy Studies,*
*UiTM Seremban, N. Sembilan*

## ABSTRACT

*The government aim 7% of the graduates will be employed within six months after their graduation (The Star, 2015). It is because if the graduates are not employed, it will be lost to the government as the government already spends many for the graduate's education since the primary level to the higher educational level. Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia is successful initiatives since it helps seventy thousand graduates either directly or non-directly participate in the program to be employed, which reduced the unemployment rate among the graduates in this country (Sinar Harian, 2015). The effectiveness is not only depending on the results among the participants of Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia (SL1M) but it also can be evaluated on the other attribute. Thus this study is conducted to identify what are the other attributes that can be used to associate with the effectiveness of the Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia (SL1M). 100 respondents had been choosing among those who had participated in this program since Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia being introduced in 2011. From the findings, it shows that SL1M really assist the participants in fulfill all variables as proposed in Kirkpatrick's Training Model where it gave advantage to then to get work after completing the training.*

*Keywords: Kirkpatrick's Training Evaluation Model , SL1M*

## 1. Introduction

Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia is successful initiatives since it helps seventy thousand graduates either directly or non-directly participate in the program to be employed, which reduced the unemployment rate among the graduates in this country (www.sinarharian.com.my). The main objective of Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia is to enhance the employability of graduates in securing a job upon completion of the training scheme (www.epu.gov.my). This Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia is collaboration between the government with the private sector under their Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) by giving opportunity to the fresh graduates having training with the organisation as initiatives to groom and enhance the employability of Malaysian graduates, especially those from rural areas and low income families. One of the reasons that lead to this program created by the government is due to the studies conducted by the Ministry of Higher Education, the result shows that twenty five per cent of graduates did not secure employment within six months from their graduation and most of them are underprivileged graduates. Concern with the issues of unemployment that arise, the government comes with these initiatives to help the fresh graduates by giving them platform to increase and polish their skills and experience. For current record, there are one hundred and eighteen companies with more than nineteen thousand graduates already directly joining the SL1M program and based on record, majority of the participant are being hired during and after completion of the training either by the organization that trained them or other company. It shows that this effort even not in full but partly may reduce the number of unemployment among graduates and this paper aims to study on the effectiveness of SL1M by relate it to Kirkpatrick's Training Evaluation Model. The paper begins with analyzing the problem statement by looking the current scenario on the issues of unemployment among graduates. Later, researchers identify the aims of this study and discuss some literature based on the variables suggested in Kirkpatrick's Model which are *Reaction, Learning, Behavior* and *Result*. Sets of questionnaires being distributed to respondents and analysis have been done in the next section. Finally, researchers conclude and provide some recommendation for future study.

### 1.2 Problem Statement

Many of these fresh graduates are unpolished which their skills are not really exposed but they have potential inside. These can be seen through studies conducted by the Ministry of Higher Education, the result shows that twenty five per cent of graduates did not secure employment within six months from their graduation and most of them are underprivileged graduates. Based on the Official Website of SL1M, from the first and second phase of SL1M, 0.7% participants out of 8, 262 failed to secure jobs within the training period. The participant failed to get the job due to several reason such as the failure to speaks in English proficiently, low self-esteem, the qualification does not follow the requirement and lack of professionalism skills and unable to

communicate well. Besides, based on the experience on the participant itself during receive the training, the training period is insufficient as they do not have adequate time to practice what they had learn in the learning session when applying in the real work environment. The effectiveness is not only depending on the results among the participant Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia (SL1M) but it also can be evaluated on the other attribute. Thus this study is conducted to identify what is the other attribute that can be used to associate with the effectiveness of the Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia (SL1M).

### 1.3 Research Objective

1.3.1    To identify whether SL1M helps the graduate to be employed.
1.3.2 To identify which of the attribute of the Kirkpatrick's Training Evaluation Model associated the most with the effectiveness of the Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia (SL1M)
1.3.3    To know the weakness of the program based on the feedback given by the previous candidate that already participate in the program so that improvement can be suggest and made to increase the success level of the program.

## 2.    Literature Review

### 2.1.    Training effectiveness and evaluation

A well designed and executed training can be one the determinant that would be able to enhance the participant involvement, attitudinal changes and eventually an opportunity for the application of learning in workplace (Farjad, 2012). According to Tracy et al as cited by Alyahya & Norsiah (n.d), the conceptualized of the training effectiveness comprises the training acquisition and also the training transfer. Which mean in here once the participant able to acquire the knowledge and skill provided during training program and able to apply what they have learned, it mean that the training has likely achieve it effectiveness. Broad and Newstrom (1992) as cited by Alyahya & Norsiah (n.d), also shared a similar view as it noted that in order for the training to be considered as effectives the trainee must actually transferred the knowledge and skill learnt during the training program into job. According to Mollahoseini & Farjad (2012), in order for the training program to be effectives, the learning content for the training must able to be adopting in the workplace. In fact a number of researcher as Baldwin & Ford (1988); Broad & Newstom (1992); Ford & Wesbein (1997) has come out with a conclusion that most of the money that has been spent on training program were wasted due to the 10%-15% of what has been learnt by the trainee were not able to find it ways in job. In here it can be seen that most of the researcher believe that it would be a total waste and ineffective if what the trainee learnt would not be applicable to the job or work related.

According to Bramley (1996), training effectiveness can be defined as the measurement of the observable changes in knowledge, skill and attitude after training has been conducted (Mollahoseini & Farjad, 2012). Which means in order to see or identify the effectiveness of the training program, the changes that occurs toward the trainee's knowledge, skill and attitude will be measured. Meanwhile, Alvares, Salas & Garafano (2004) defined training effectiveness as the variable that most likely to influence the outcome of the training at different stages of the training process. Abdel-Wahab, Daintly, Ison, & Hazlehurst (2008) agreed that each of the training program should undergo an evaluation process as it can be said that it is the best way to ensure or ascertained that the financial investment of the training program is worth it or not (S.Borat, Gopalkrishna, & H.C., 2014). Training evaluation is one of the most important component in the developing the personal development which needed a sufficient amount of attention especially by the project manager, project team and their organization (Lee-Kelley & Blackman, 2011). As according to Buckley and Cape, (1990) as cited by Lee-Kelley & Blackman (2011) stated that the training evaluation is a process which is aims to seeks to weight  the cost of training with intended learning outcome and the assessment is done to evaluate in term of the improved skill and work performance as for those who underwent the training program. Evaluation can be seen as one of the important methodology and model that can be used in order to influence the significant impact on the performance.

### 2.2 Kirkpatrick's Training Evaluation Model

Kirkpatrick's Training Evaluation Model is one the model that can used in order to evaluate and measure whether the training program that has be conducted has achieves its effectiveness or not (Rouse, 2011). The model has lined out four level on how the training program can be evaluate which is the first level would be the reaction, second level is learning, third level would be the behavior and the fourth level is the results. These levels will be used as the evaluation instrument to identify the effectiveness of the training program. According to Philip (1999), as cited by Alyahya & Norsiah (n.d), has confirmed that the Kirkpatrick's Training Evaluation Model is probably the widely accepted framework for classifying the different area of evaluation.

#### 2.2.1    Level 1- Reaction
Reaction in here is referred to the degree participant react favorably toward the training program (Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2009). The reaction of the participant would be measure to see their level of satisfaction toward the program. It is important for the training program to measure the satisfaction of the participant it would as it is related on how the participant perceived toward the training (Nikols, 2013). Level one evaluation should not just include reactions toward the overall program (e.g., Did you like the program?) it will also include the measurement of participants' reactions or attitudes toward specific components of the program, such as the instructor, the topics, the presentation style, the schedule, audiovisuals, etc. (Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2006). The Kirkpatrick's Training Evaluation Model reaction attribute, it reflects on to what degree participants react favourably to the training. This can be associated by capturing the participant's reaction to the Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia (SL1M) Program on their reaction to the training method, facilities to conduct the training, the trainers' qualification and some more

(www.trainingcheck.com). It is important to measure the participant reaction towards the training because as according to Nikols, the participant reaction is related on how the participant perceived toward the training. Their reaction will influence in their next step which is learning as when they satisfy with the program, it is easier for them in the learning process. Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia is on job going process whereby the activities involved the whole period of training. The duration of Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia program is between eight months to a year. It is important to evaluate the participant reaction to ensure the objective of SL1M is achieved. The satisfaction of the participant after joined the program also can used in order to associate it with the reaction attribute in the Kirkpatrick's evaluation model.

### 2.2.2 Level 2-Learning

This level emphasizing on to which extend the learning has occurs. In other word this level will deal with the acquisition of the knowledge and skill during the training program (Nikols, 2013). In here it means that the participant's intellectual capability and skill will be measured to see the degree of understanding on the material learned during the training process. The module that will use in the training also will determine whether the learning process would be able to occur or not. Training modules will contain basic texts, model forms, short handouts for workshops, and notes for trainers. Based on this model, learning attribute will measure the degree of participants in acquired the intended knowledge, skills, attitudes, confidence and commitment based on their participation in a training event. In order to associate with the effectiveness of Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia, the researcher has captured on how the training program helps the participant to improve their skills and knowledge after being train. In SL1M program, the organization will give training based on the module endorsed by the Economy Planning Unit (EPU). The module must comprehensive and relevant so that the objectives of the SL1M can be achieved (www.epu.gov.my, 2015). The purpose of the training is to enhance the skills of the participant and it covers five components which are communication, creative and analytical thinking, organizational adaptability, value driven professional and grooming and etiquette. By giving different component of module, it hopes that it can help the participant to increase their skills in all aspect (TheStar, 2013). This can be measured by make an evaluation to the participant on their understanding before and after the learning process so that can see if the learning is success or not (www.businessballs.com, 2015).

### 2.2.3 Level 3-Behavior

This level is emphasizing on to which extend the participant is applying what they have learned during their training when their back on the job (Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2009). In here it refers to the ability of the participant of the training program to transfer all their learning from the training to the real life job that they had. Therefore it can be said that, leaning process during the training program might be able to equipped the participant with the right knowledge and skill yet it's all depends on the participant in applying what they have learned when they were on the real job situation. For instance according to Kirkpatrick (1998) as cited by Bradley& Connors, (2013), measuring the behavior of the participant change require the participant to (1) learned the knowledge or attained the skill at training, (2) has the opportunity to apply this new learning or skill back on the job, (3) has incentives for applying new learning or skill and continue to do so rather than slip back in to old behavior and (4) can attribute the change into the training course which mean in here if the participant are able to fulfill this requirement it means that the training process has successfully instill the changes in the behavior of the participant. Based on the Kirkpatrick's Training Evaluation Model behaviour attribute, it reflects on to what degree participants react favourably to the training. As the participant involves in training, they will gain new knowledge and increase their skills. This level will evaluate on how the participant used the skills and knowledge that they get during training period and practiced in their work. Since SL1M module covers five different type of component, it should boost the participant skills whereby they should be more confident and skillful. After learn all the component during the training, the participant should able to apply what have they learn into real job experience as they already equipped with the knowledge and skills. For example one of the components learns is communication. In the training period the participant are teaches to communicate more confidently as nowadays the graduates are having low confidents and poor communication skill which cause them difficult to be employed (Fauzi,2012).

### 2.2.4 Results

This level is referred to what degree the targeted outcome occurred. Which mean in here the individual or the participant that attend the program would be able to enjoyed the benefit from the training itself. Since they have been equipped with the right knowledge and skill during the training program, it would help them to excel in performing their task. Other than that, as the result from the training program, it would also increase the employee's retention where it refers to the ability of the organization to retain the organization as they valued these trainees as their main asset (Klenke, 2013). Once the employees are able to receive and feel the outcome benefited through the training conducted while they are performing their job, it means that the training has achieved it effectiveness. Result attribute which related to what degree targeted outcomes occur as a result of the training event and subsequent reinforcement. In order to associate with the effectiveness of Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia, the results not only can be seen on the participant achievement but it also can be measure through the performance of organization conduct training, whether training that they conducted gives a positives feedback or nothing change to the participant skills. In the result stage, it shows the result of the participant whether they gain benefit from the SL1M program or not. 19 700 participant already being employed after participated in SL1M (TheStar, 2013). They already equipped with the knowledge and skills during the training so in here it will see whether the training that they get previously will benefit them or not. Based on the previous study, it shows majority of the participant being employed during the training period. One of the reason is it increase the employee's retention where it refer to the ability of the organization to retain the organization as they valued these trainee as their main asset (Klenke, 2013). Furthermore the effectiveness of the SL1M program can be measured to the results of participant as once the employees are able to receive and feel the outcome benefited through the training conducted while they are performing their job, it means that the training has achieved it effectiveness as it is parallel with the objective of program.

## 3. Research Methodology

| Variables | Method |
|---|---|
| Research design | Quantitative |
| Sampling size | 370 (based on Krejcie & Morgan table) |
| Sampling technique | Simple Random Sampling Technique |
| Data collection method | Primary (Questionaire) Secondary (Books & Web searching) |
| Data analysis | Frequency (Respondents profile Correlation Regression |

## 4. Findings and Analysis

### Table 4.1 Profile of respondents

| Demographic Variables | | Frequency (f) | Percent (%) |
|---|---|---|---|
| Gender | Male | 165 | 44.6 |
| | Female | 205 | 55.4 |
| Age | 20-24 Years old | 65 | 17.6 |
| | 25-29 Years old | 235 | 63.5 |
| | 30-34 Years old | 70 | 18.9 |
| Race | Malay | 221 | 59.7 |
| | Chinese | 80 | 21.6 |
| | Indian | 50 | 13.5 |
| | Others | 19 | 5.1 |
| Background of Education | Social Science | 55 | 14.9 |
| | Engineering | 74 | 20.0 |
| | Banking | 38 | 10.3 |
| | Education | 19 | 5.1 |
| | Science | 55 | 14.9 |
| | Others | 129 | 34.9 |
| Managed to secure job after (SL1M) | Yes | 278 | 75.1 |
| | No | 92 | 24.9 |

Most of the respondents are female aged between 25 – 29 years old. The trainees that mostly involved with SL1M are Malays having various backgrounds during their primary education. From the responds, it shows that most of the trainees managed to get the job after having the training with SL1M (75.1%).

### Table 4.2 Correlation Analysis

| Variables | Correlation Coefficient,r | Sig. p | N |
|---|---|---|---|
| Reaction | .533[**] | .000 | 370 |
| Behavior | .414[**] | .000 | 370 |
| Result | .299[**] | .000 | 370 |
| Learning | .203[**] | .000 | 370 |

Based on finding, it shows that reaction is the attributes that having strong relationship with the effectiveness of SL1M (.533) followed by behavior (.414) and result (.299). The least attributes that have very minimum relationships towards effectiveness of SL1M is learning (.203). It shows that the modules or references used during SL1M not really effective in creating the intellectual capability and skills of trainees.

**Table 4.3 Multiple Regression Analysis**

| Variables | Beta value | Sig. p | N |
|---|---|---|---|
| Reaction | .502 | .000 | 370 |
| Behavior | .395 | .000 | 370 |
| Result | .111 | .004 | 370 |
| Learning | .063 | .132 | 370 |

Based on the table 3.3, reaction, behavior and result have a significantly predated on the effectiveness of Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia (SL1M) Program where $F_{(4, 365)} = 80.539$, $P < 0.05$. Other than that, result, behavior and reaction also have a high multiple regression where $P < 0.05$. However, learning have significance value 0.132 which is higher than 0.05. Therefore reaction, behavior and result attribute the most to the effectiveness of SL1M Program.

## 5. Discussion and Conclusion

### 5.1 RO1: To identify whether Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia helps the graduate to be employed.

Based on the research finding, the researches come out with the results that Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia helps the graduates to be employed. This can be seen through the survey conducted, 278 (75.1%) of the respondent was managed to secure the job after joined Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia program. It shows that SL1M was effective in eradicating unemployment in Malaysia. It is because, from the responds given, most of the trainees have positive react towards the modules and the process along the training session. Besides, when they performed, the employer who had venture with SL1M will appoint them as become part of their company's members due to the performance showed during session. This can indirectly reduce the number of unemployment in Malaysia.

### 5.2 RO2: To identify the attribution of Kirkpatrick's Training Evaluation Model in associates with Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia (SL1M).

For second research objective, the researchers want to identify the Kirkpatrick's Training Evaluation Model in associates with Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia (SL1M). Kirkpatrick's Training Evaluation Model consists of four stages which are reaction, learning, behavior and results. Kirkpatrick model was used to evaluate training program. The researcher used this model to evaluate Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia effectiveness since this program was training program provided by the government.

### 5.3 RO3: To know the weakness of Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia based on the feedback given by the previous candidate that already participate in the program so that improvement can be suggest and made to increase the success level of the program.

Based on the research finding, the researchers able to identify the weakness of the program that needs improvement based on the respondents' feedback. The researchers create research based on the four attributes in the Kirkpatrick Model. There were few variables that need improvement based on the respondent experienced. One of it was regarding time frame of the learning process whereby 27.8% and 30% respondent gave response strongly disagree and disagree that Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia provide sufficient time duration for learning to the trainee.

### 5.4 Conclusion and recommendation

From the findings, SL1M is one of the programs under *1Malaysia Concept* that can be said as successful program because it helps government in overcoming the issue of unemployment in Malaysia. Through responds, 75% of trainees that joined this program managed to secure their job because they are given an opportunity to continue their services with the company that joined the SL1M program. This benefited the trainees as well as employer because they don't have to spend more time and money to have another training session with new workers because they did while them in SL1M. So, indirectly this effort can assist government in eradicating numbers of unemployment especially among youth in Malaysia. This finding answers the first objective of this paper in order to identify whether this program helps graduate get the work after completion. In addition, thru feedbacks, it proof that Kirkpatrick's Model is the best framework in order to measure the effectiveness of SL1M. All the variables in the model supported the analysisi since all factors have a very significance

relationship with the implementation of SL1M, p<.05. This supported the objectives number two. Finally, from the feedback, respondents had claims that the duration of this training is not sufficient since it offers a short term session.

It can be concluded that this program was effective and worth for the government. When there is decreasing number of unemployment due to participating in SL1M, this program contributed value add and sustainability not only to the trainees but also to the aspect socio-economy. Everyone gets the job and gains their salaries and when they spend, it can contribute to our economy. At the same time, when there are enough human resources in producing the products, there's no issue on shortage in production, and government or even companies can maintain their producing power and indirectly generate profit from that. It shows that, SL1M really contributed to the positive impact towards life of individuals and situation of peace and harmony because of stability in socio- economy and political aspects resulted from the effectiveness of this program.

However, during completing the research, there was limitation that needs to be faced by the researchers especially in term of getting cooperation from the respondents. The researcher personally contacts the respondents through private message in social media such as Facebook and Whatsapp. Each of respondents was given clear information to the researchers regarding on the survey conducted. Unfortunately, not all the potential respondents that the researchers contacted gave cooperation to answer the survey.

As for suggestion especially to the implementer, due to feedback, government should expand the duration for training so that trainees can really absorb, adopt and adapt the input from the training and make them more confidence before entering the real world of working environment. In addition, module should be improvise in order to make sure it updated with the current working demands.

### References

Alyahya, M. S., & Norsiah, M. (n.d). Evaluation On The Effectiveness Of Training And Development: The Kirkpatrick's Model. *Asian Journal of Business and Management Sciences, 2*(11).

D.Blume, B., Ford, J. K., Baldwin, T. T., & Huang, J. L. (2010). Transfer of Training: Meta Analytic Review. *Journal of Management, 36*(4).

Farjad, S. (2012). The evaluation Effectiveness of Training Courses in University by Kirkpatrick Model (Case study: Islamshahr Univeristy). *Procedia Social and Behavioural Science*.

Kirkpatrick, D. L., & Kirkpatrick, J. D. (2009). *Evaluating Training Program: The four level.* Berrett-Koehler Publishers.

Lee-Kelley, L., & Blackman, D. (2011). Project traning evaluation: Reshaping boundry objects and assumptions. *International Journal of Project Management*.

Mollahoseini, A., & Farjad, S. (2012). Assestment Effectivness on the job training in Higher Education (case study: Takestan University). *Procedia-Social and Behavioural Sciences, 47*.

Nikols, F. (2013). Retrieved from Leveraging the Kirkpatrick Model: Validation vs Evaluation: http://www.nickols.us/LeveragingKirkpatrick.pdf

Rouse, D. N. (2011). Employing Kirkpatrick's Evaluation Framework to Detremine the Effectiveness of Health Information Management Courses and Programs. *Online Research Journal Perspective in Health Management*.

Ramirez, R. F. (2014). *700,000 Fresh Graduates Swell Ranks Of Jobless.* Retrieved on 1st December 2015 from http://www.manilatimes.net/700000-fresh-graduates-swell-ranks-ofjobless/8 2057

S.Borat, N., Gopalkrishna, & H.C., S. P. (2014). A Case Study Approach for Evaluation of Employee Training Effectivness and Development program. *The International Journal of Business and Management, 2*(6).

SinarHarian. (2015, November 11). *SL1M Bantu Graduan Ketika Temuduga*. Retrieved November 21, 2015, from Sinar Harian Online: www.sinarharian.com/mobile/nasional/sl1m-bantu-graduan-ketika-temu-duga-1.450520

TheStar. (2015, June 15). *Average rate of unemployed Malaysian at 3%.* Retrieved November 22, 2015, from The Star Online: www.thestar.com.my/news/nation/2015/06/15/average-rate-of-unemployed-msians-at-3/

TheStar. (2015, October 18). *Industry-Ready Training For Grads*. Retrieved November 22, 2015, from The Star Online: www.thestar.com.my/news/education/2015/10/18/industryready-training-for-grads/

TrainingIndustry.com. (n.d). *Four levels of evaluation*. Retrieved November 20, 2015, from Training Industry: www.trainingindustry.com/wiki/entries/four-levels-of-evaluation.aspx

Unit, T. O. (n.d). *Skim Latihan 1 Malaysia*. Retrieved November 17, 2015, from www.epu.gov.my/sl1m

Yusliena, Y. (2001). *A Study On The Need Of Practical Training For Accounting Students: Student Perceptions.* Retrived on 1st December 2015 from ir.uitm.edfu.my/3173/1/YUSLIENA_YUSOFF_01_24.pdf